The Performance of Leftist Governments in Latin America

What Does the LEFT Do RIGHT?

MARCH 6–7, 2008
Texas Union, Santa Rita Room, 3.502
University of Texas at Austin

KEYNOTE ADDRESS

RICARDO LAGOS
Former President of Chile presents 2008 Lozano Long Lecture
Democracy, Equity, and Growth:
18 years of Democratic Coalition Government in Chile
Thursday, March 6, 4:00–5:00 P.M.

THIS EVENT IS COORDINATED BY PROFESSORS WENDY HUNTER, RAÚL MADRID, AND KURT WEYLAND
AND IS SPONSORED BY THE TERESA LOZANO LONG INSTITUTE OF LATIN AMERICAN STUDIES,
STERLING CLARK HOLLOWAY CENTENNIAL LECTURESHIP IN LIBERAL ARTS, DEPARTMENT
OF GOVERNMENT, AND THE OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT, UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT AUSTIN
Conference at a Glance

This scholarly meeting will examine the achievements and failures of left-of-center governments in Bolivia, Brazil, Chile, and Venezuela in the economic, social, and political sphere. Leading analysts from those four countries, outstanding experts from the United States, and a group of high-ranking politicians will discuss the left’s capacity to enhance economic prosperity, improve social equity, and promote effective democratization, political inclusion, and citizenship.

By examining all of these issues, this conference hopes to elucidate the true significance of Latin America’s recent turn to the left and to explore the region’s development prospects in the foreseeable future.

THURSDAY, MARCH 6

8:30–9:00 A.M.
WELCOME AND INTRODUCTION

9:00–10:30 A.M.
PANEL ON BRAZIL

10:45 A.M.–12:15 P.M.
PANEL ON VENEZUELA

2:00–3:30 P.M.
PANEL ON CHILE

4:00–5:00 P.M.
LOZANO LONG KEYNOTE ADDRESS
Ricardo Lagos

5:30–6:30 P.M.
RECEPTION
in honor of Ricardo Lagos

FRIDAY, MARCH 7

9:00–10:30 A.M.
PANEL ON BOLIVIA

10:45 A.M.–12:00 Noon
CONCLUDING PANEL
What has the recent wave of left-wing governments in Latin America actually accomplished? Have these administrations managed to implement significant changes to the “neoliberal” model and bring social improvements to the poorer sectors of the population? What effect have they had on political participation and citizenship?

Much has been written about the surprising resurgence of the Latin American left during the last decade and its success in capturing the presidency in many countries of the region. Scholars and other observers have analyzed the role that social movements and political parties have played in electing left-wing governments. They also have distinguished different strands of the new left, contrasting, for instance, the radicalism of Venezuela’s Hugo Chávez with the moderation of Chile’s Michelle Bachelet and Brazil’s Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva, who are said to pursue a Latin American variant of social democracy.

The LLILAS conference will push the discussion one big step further. Rather than reflecting again on the causes of Latin America’s turn to the left, it will examine its consequences. The focus will be on the substantive programs and policy decisions of progressive governments in four select countries that represent the diversity of the Latin American left, namely, Bolivia, Brazil, Chile, and Venezuela.

The conference will examine a range of important questions including:

- What elements of the traditional leftist agenda do these administrations emphasize and pursue? How do they modify this agenda in light of the new constraints arising from economic globalization, the legacies of domestic market reform, and the liberal, pluralist institutions of more or less consolidated democracies?
- What has been the economic performance of the Latin American left in its different versions? What results have the more radical challenges to neoliberalism produced, and how do they compare with the more moderate approach in Chile and Brazil? Did the latter administrations noticeably change the market-oriented approach of their rightist or centrist predecessors or were they trapped in the iron cage of continuity? How sustainable are the different economic policy approaches pursued in the four countries?
- Have leftist governments improved the social well-being of poorer groups? Where has poverty diminished the most, and why—due to economic growth or social reforms? Have left-of-center administrations managed to alleviate or reduce the stark inequalities plaguing all four countries? Have there been major reforms in other areas, such as education, health care, and social security? What role—if any—have structural reforms such as land redistribution played?
- Have leftist leaders respected existing democratic institutions or have they sought to bypass such institutions in order to enact their preferred policies? Have leftist governments introduced effective participatory mechanisms into Latin America’s representative democracies? Have there been significant efforts at dismantling barriers of discrimination and at integrating long-excluded ethnic or racial groups into the mainstream of political and socioeconomic development?
In 1999 Ricardo Lagos, a member of the Socialist Party, secured the presidential nomination of Concertación, a coalition that included the Socialists and the Christian Democrats. Victorious in a runoff election in January 2000, he became the first Socialist to hold the presidency since Allende. As president, Lagos vowed not to block attempts to prosecute Pinochet, an action that would create deep divisions within Chilean society. During his term, his popularity was bolstered by the country’s impressive economic growth and by the adoption of democratic reforms. Under his leadership, Chile also enacted major social reforms, including the legalization of divorce. Lagos left office in 2006 and was succeeded by another Socialist, Michelle Bachelet, the country’s first woman president. He finished his term in 2006 with approval ratings that surpassed 70 percent.

Between 1971 and 1972, Lagos served as Director of the university’s Institute of Law. During this decade, he also served as Director of the Latin American Council of Social Sciences and as a visiting professor at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. He recently was appointed Professor-at-Large at Brown University.

In the 1980s, Lagos was President of the Democratic Alliance, a group from the major parties that opposed the rule of General Pinochet. He was Minister of Education in the administration of Patricio Aylwin, the first President of Chile following the end of military rule, and later was Minister of Public Works in the administration of Eduardo Frei Ruiz-Tagle.

In 2007, Ricardo Lagos was appointed Special Envoy on Climate Change by UN Secretary-General Ban ki-Moon, assisting the Secretary-General in his consultations with governments and other stakeholders regarding the progress of multilateral agreements on climate change.

THURSDAY, MARCH 6

8:30–9:00 A.M.
WELCOME AND INTRODUCTION
Introductory Remarks
Bryan Roberts, UT Austin
Kurt Weyland, UT Austin

9:00–10:30 A.M.
PANEL ON BRAZIL
CHAIR
Robert Wilson, UT Austin

PANELISTS
Lula’s Administration on the Edge:
Perspectives on the Combination of Stability and Development
Pedro Luiz Barros Silva, UNICAMP, Brazil
José Carlos Braga, UNICAMP, Brazil
Vera Cabral, FUNDAP, Brazil

From Cardoso to Lula: The Triumph of Pragmatic Neoliberalism in Brazil
Peter Kingstone, University of Connecticut
Aldo Ponce, University of Houston

DISCUSSANT
Wendy Hunter, UT Austin

10:30–10:45 A.M.
Coffee Break
10:45 A.M.–12:15 P.M.
**PANEL ON VENEZUELA**

**CHAIR**
Patricia Wilson, UT Austin

**PANELISTS**

*How “Revolutionary” Is Venezuela’s Development Model?*
Javier Corrales, Amherst College

*The Diverse Models of Chavismo and Their Performance on Political, Economic, and Social Fronts*
Steve Ellner, Universidad del Oriente, Venezuela

**DISCUSSANT**
Kurt Weyland, UT Austin

12:15–2:00 P.M.
Lunch Break

2:00–3:30 P.M.
**PANEL ON CHILE**

**CHAIR**
William Glade, UT Austin

**PANELISTS**

*Progress and Setbacks in the Search of Growth-with-Equity in Chile*
Ricardo Ffrench-Davis, ECLAC, Chile

*The Left in Chile: Moving beyond the Transition?*
Evelyne Huber, UNC Chapel Hill
Jennifer Pribble, UNC Chapel Hill

**DISCUSSANT**
Raúl Madrid, UT Austin

3:30–3:45 P.M.
Coffee Break

4:00–5:00 P.M.
**LOZANO LONG KEYNOTE ADDRESS**

Introduction
Bryan Roberts, UT Austin

*Democracy, Equity, and Growth: Eighteen Years of Democratic Coalition Government in Chile*
Ricardo Lagos, President of Chile 2000–2006

5:30–6:30 P.M.
Reception in honor of Ricardo Lagos
FRIDAY, MARCH 7

9:00–10:30 A.M.
PANEL ON BOLIVIA
CHAIR
Charles Hale, UT Austin (TBC)

The Post-Neoliberal Challenge in Bolivia: Any Room for the Left in the Global Economy?
George Gray Molina, UNDP-Bolivia

Be Careful What You Wish for: Challenges to a Progressive Administration in Bolivia
Benjamin Kohl, Temple University
Linda Farthing, Independent scholar

DISCUSSANT
Raúl Madrid, UT Austin

10:30–10:45 A.M.
Coffee Break

10:45 A.M.–12:00 Noon
CONCLUDING PANEL
CHAIR
Bryan Roberts, UT Austin
Francisco Weffort, Former Minister of Culture, Brazil
Steven Levitsky, Harvard University
Wendy Hunter, UT Austin
PEDRO LUIZ BARROS SILVA

Pedro Luiz Barros Silva is currently a member of the faculty of the Institute of Economics at the Universidade Estadual de Campinas (State University of Campinas, Brazil), one of the premier universities in the country. He has served as the Coordinator of the Center for the Study of Public Policy, and is now the Coordinator of the Upper-Level Personnel Improvement Coordination. He has published numerous articles and book chapters in his areas of expertise, which include the Brazilian economy, politics and social policy, and evaluation of public policy and reform of the state. He was the first Rio Branco Visiting Chair at the University of Texas at Austin in 2001, teaching a graduate seminar called “The State, Government, and Public Policy in Contemporary Brazil.” The course examined the challenges the Brazilian government faces in the new century and the nature, reach, and limits of governmental intervention available to address these challenges.

VERA LÚCIA CABRAL COSTA

Vera Lúcia Cabral Costa is Technical Director of Social Policy at FUNDAP, Fundação do Desenvolvimento Administrativo (Foundation of Administrative Development) in Brazil. She received a master’s degree in economics from the University of São Paulo and a Ph.D. in economics from the Institute of Economics at the Universidade Estadual de Campinas in Brazil. She is the author of Decentralização da Educação: Novas Formas de Coordenação e Financ [Decentralization of Education: New Ways for Coordination and Finance].

JAVIER CORRALES

Javier Corrales is Associate Professor and Chair of Political Science at Amherst College in Massachusetts. He obtained his Ph.D. in political science from Harvard University, specializing in the politics of economic and social policy reform in developing countries. Dr. Corrales is author of Presidents without Parties: The Politics of Economic Reform in Argentina and Venezuela in the 1990s. He has written extensively on the Chávez regime, most recently, a 2007 coauthored article in the Journal of Democracy, entitled “Venezuela: Crowding Out the Opposition.” In 2005, he was a Fulbright Scholar in Caracas and then a visiting lecturer at the Center for Research and Documentation on Latin America in Amsterdam. In 2000, he became one of the youngest scholars ever to be selected as a Fellow at the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars in Washington, D.C.

STEVE ELLNER

Steve Ellner is Professor of Economic History at the Universidad de Oriente in Puerto la Cruz, Venezuela, as well as a teacher on the Law and Political Science faculties of the Universidad Central de Venezuela. He recently has been a visiting professor in the Latin
American Studies departments of Duke University and Georgetown University, and has written numerous books and articles on the Latin American left, Venezuelan politics, and Hugo Chávez.

LINDA FARTHING
Linda Farthing is a writer, educator, and editor who lived in Bolivia for eight years. She has extensive experience in grassroots community development, particularly with women, in both Bolivia and Nepal. She has taught university students, edited social science books, and written more than 50 articles and radio reports on Bolivia. Most recently, with Ben Kohl, she coauthored *Impasse in Bolivia: Neoliberal Hegemony and Popular Resistance*.

RICARDO FFRENCH-DAVIS
Ricardo Ffrench-Davis is Professor of Economics at the University of Chile and former Principal Regional Adviser of ECLAC (UN Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean). He also has been the Director of Research and Chief Economist at the Central Bank of Chile as well as a co-founder and Vice-President of the Center for Economic Research on Latin America (CIEPLAN). In addition, he has represented Presidents Ricardo Lagos and Michelle Bachelet in the International Initiative to Fight Hunger and Poverty. He has published 20 books and more than 120 articles on international trade and finance, development strategies, and Latin American economies, including *Reforming Latin America’s Economies after Market Fundamentalism* and *Economic Reforms in Chile: From Dictatorship to Democracy*. In 2005, he was awarded the Chilean National Prize for the Humanities and Social Sciences.

WILLIAM GLADE
William Glade is Emeritus Professor of Economics at the University of Texas at Austin, where he taught until 2007. Previously he taught at the Universities of Wisconsin and Maryland. He also served as Interim Secretary of the Latin American Program of the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars. He was Director of the Institute of Latin American Studies at UT Austin for more than fifteen years and later served as Director of the Mexican Center of LLILAS. Dr. Glade also was President of the Latin American Studies Association (LASA). His research and teaching included Latin American economic development and more recently trade, and cultural and political production in the context of NAFTA.

GEORGE GRAY MOLINA
George Gray Molina is the coordinator of the United Nations Development Program in Bolivia. He has extensive experience with development issues, having also served as the Executive Director for the Bolivian Economic and Social Policy Analysis Unit and as the Director of the Master’s Program for Public Policy at the Bolivian Catholic University. Dr.
Molina has written extensively for PNUD (Programa de las Naciones Unidas para el Desarrollo); one of his most recent publications is “The State of Opinion: Polls in Human Development in Bolivia.” Dr. Molina received his Ph.D. in philosophy of politics from Oxford University in 2003.

CHARLES R. HALE
Charles R. Hale is Professor of Anthropology at the University of Texas at Austin and specializes in social and activist anthropology. He received his Ph.D. from Stanford University. His research interests include race/ethnicity, identity politics, consciousness and resistance, activist anthropology, Latin America, and the Caribbean. One of his latest publications is *Más que un Indio: Racial Ambivalence and Neoliberal Multiculturalism in Guatemala*. Hale is recent past President of the Latin American Studies Association.

WENDY HUNTER
Wendy Hunter is Associate Professor in the Department of Government at the University of Texas at Austin. She studies comparative politics with an emphasis on Latin American affairs. Dr. Hunter has done in-depth work on the military in Brazil and the Southern Cone, as well as research on social policy issues in Latin America, with special attention to the politics of education and health reform. She is currently writing a book on the Workers’ Party in Brazil.

EVELYNE HUBER
Evelyne Huber is the Morehead Alumni Professor of Political Science and Chair of the Political Science Department at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. Her interests are in comparative politics and political economy, with an area focus mainly on Latin America and the Caribbean, but also on broader comparisons between Latin America and Europe. Dr. Huber is author of *The Politics of Workers’ Participation: The Peruvian Approach in Comparative Perspective*, and coauthor of *Democratic Socialism in Jamaica* (with John D. Stephens), *Capitalist Development and Democracy* (with Dietrich Rueschemeyer and John D. Stephens), and *Development and Crisis of the Welfare State* (with John D. Stephens). She was also winner of the 2001 Best Book Award from the American Political Science Association, Political Economy Section. She is currently doing research on comparative social policy.

PETER KINGSTONE
Peter Kingstone is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Connecticut. He received his Ph.D. from the University of California, Berkeley. He is the author of *Crafting Coalitions for Reform*, coeditor (with Timothy Power) of *Democratic Brazil: Actors, Institutions, and Processes*, and editor of *Challenges to Democratization: Readings in Lat-
Benjamin Kohl is Associate Professor of Geography and Urban Studies at Temple University. He has worked on issues related to planning, development and politics in Bolivia for twenty years. Most recently, with Linda Farthing, he coauthored *Impasse in Bolivia: Neoliberal Hegemony and Popular Resistance*.

Steven Levitsky is Associate Professor of Government and Social Studies at Harvard University. He received his Ph.D. from the University of California, Berkeley. Professor Levitsky’s areas of research include political parties and party change, informal institutions and organizations, and political regimes and regime change, with a focus on Argentina and Peru. He is author of *Transforming Labor-Based Parties in Latin America: Argentine Peronism in Comparative Perspective*. He is currently writing a book on the rise of competitive authoritarian regimes in Latin America, Africa, Asia, East-Central Europe, and the former Soviet Union during the post–Cold War era, and is coediting a book on informal institutions in Latin America. He teaches such courses as Introduction to Comparative Politics, Comparative Politics of Latin America, and Democracy and Authoritarianism in Latin America.

Raúl Madrid is Associate Professor in the Government Department at the University of Texas at Austin. Professor Madrid’s current research focuses on the emergence of ethno-populist parties in the Andean nations. His book-in-progress seeks to explain under what circumstances parties based in Latin America’s indigenous movements succeed. From 2004–2007, he served as Associate Editor for the *Latin American Research Review*, the journal of the Latin American Studies Association. Dr. Madrid holds a Ph.D. in political science from Stanford University.

Jennifer Pribble is a doctoral candidate in political science at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, with a specialization in Latin American political economy. She is currently writing her dissertation, which analyzes the emergence and reform of anti-poverty policies in Latin America. She recently published the article “Women and Welfare: The Politics of Coping with New Social Risks in Chile and Uruguay” in the *Latin American Research Review*, and is a coauthor of “Political Determinants of Inequality in Latin America and the
Caribbean,” which appeared in the *American Sociological Review*. Jennifer will join the Department of Political Science at the University of Richmond as an assistant professor in fall 2008.

BRYAN ROBERTS

Bryan Roberts, Director of the Teresa Lozano Long Institute of Latin American Studies, is Professor of Sociology and the C. B. Smith Chair in U.S.-Mexico Relations at the University of Texas at Austin. His research focuses on development, modernization, urban sociology, and sociology of work, particularly in Mexico, Argentina, and Chile. As a Principal Investigator, he has led diverse international research networks that promote comparative research in Latin America on such topics as citizenship, equity, and urban and rural segregation. Dr. Roberts has published numerous articles and papers, most recently on topics of urban demography and Latin American development. He received his Ph.D. in sociology from the University of Chicago.

JOSE CARLOS DE SOUZA BRAGA

Dr. Jose Carlos de Souza Braga received his M.A. and Ph.D. in economic science from the Universidade Estadual de Campinas in Brazil. From August 1978 to 2004, he served as a Professor of Politics at the Economic Cycle Training in Public Administration of FUNDAP, the Foundation for Development Administration in Brazil. From 1985 to 1987, he served as Special Secretary of Supply and Prices of the Ministry of Finance and shortly after was invited to be a guest professor of Brazilian economics in France. In 2003, he served as Secretary of Planning and Economic Development of the State of Amazonas, Brazil, and from 2004–2006 as Coordinator of the Centro de Estudos Econômicos de Relações Internacionais, the Center for Economic Studies of International Relations. He is currently working on a project entitled “Cycle of Studies and Debates on Financing for Development in the Scope of the Agreement of Basel II” and is teaching at the University of Campinas.

FRANCISCO WEFFORT

Francisco Weffort is currently Dean of the Institute of Political and Social Studies at the University of São Paulo. From 1995 until 2002, he was Minister of State at Brazil’s Department of Culture and in 2003 was a visiting scholar at the University of Notre Dame. He has published numerous books and articles dealing with democracy and Brazilian political thought. He received his Ph.D. from the University of São Paulo.

KURT WEYLAND

Kurt Weyland is Professor of Government and Lozano Long Professor of Latin American Politics at the University of Texas at Austin. His research interests focus on democratization, market reform, social policy and policy diffusion, and populism in Latin America. Dr. Weyland has drawn on a range of theoretical and methodological approaches, including
insights from cognitive psychology, and has done extensive field research in Argentina, Bolivia, Brazil, Chile, Costa Rica, Peru, and Venezuela. He has received research support from the SSRC and NEH and was a fellow at the Woodrow Wilson Center in Washington, D.C., in 1999–2000 and at the Kellogg Institute, University of Notre Dame, in 2004–2005. From 2001–2004, he served as Associate Editor of the *Latin American Research Review*.

**PATRICIA A. WILSON**

Patricia A. Wilson is Professor in the School of Architecture at the University of Texas at Austin. She received a Ph.D. in urban and regional planning from Cornell University. Dr. Wilson teaches international development, public participation, and conflict resolution skills, and her research interests include civic engagement and dialogue, participatory planning, international development, community development, and sustainable social development. She has worked in Peru, Mexico, El Salvador, Panama, Colombia, Bolivia, and Chile, and served as president of the Sociedad Interamericana de Planificación, the professional society of Latin American planners, from 1990 to 1992. She has published three books and numerous articles on planning and development in Latin America, including *Exports and Local Development: Mexico’s New Maquiladoras*.

**ROBERT WILSON**

Robert Wilson is the Mike Hogg Professor in Urban Policy at the LBJ School of Public Affairs at the University of Texas at Austin, where he also serves as Associate Dean. Previously, he taught at the Federal University of Pernambuco in Recife, Brazil. Dr. Wilson holds a Ph.D. in city and regional planning from the University of Pennsylvania. He was inducted into the National Order of the Southern Cross by decree of the President of Brazil in 2002. He also has served as a researcher for projects and grants from many organizations, including the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development, the Fulbright Commission, and the Tomas Rivera Center.
We would like to thank the following people for helping us to put this conference together:

Carly Castetter
Rebecca Counts
Paloma Díaz
Luis Fujiwara
Virginia Hagerty
Courtney Martínez
Sarah Meyer
Alexa Sendukas
Teresa Wingfield

Special thanks to the

University Development Office

for its support of this event.

And additional thanks to our organizers and sponsors:

Wendy Hunter
Raúl Madrid
Kurt Weyland

Sterling Clark Holloway Centennial Lectureship in Liberal Arts
Department of Government
Office of the President, University of Texas at Austin